

# Group Work Activities

Core criteria, excellence criteria, LCC and award criteria  
(Day 2)



**Green Public Procurement**

Tobias Schleicher

Jakarta, February 2013

# Overview Group Work Activities Day 2

- 1** Group Work 1: Core Criteria and Verification Methods
- 2** Group Work 2: Excellence Criteria and Verification
- 3** Group Work 3: Integration of LCC-based Criteria
- 4** Group Work 4: Award Point System for Evaluation

# Group Work 1: Core Criteria

## Core criteria:

- address the key environmental impacts
- are designed to be used with minimum additional verification effort or cost increases
- should be suitable for use by any contracting authority in the country

## Examples:

- for Paper used for normal office use a core criteria in EU GPP is that it is made of 100% recycled paper fibres
  - addresses key environmental impact of paper

Core criteria can be interpreted as mandatory minimum requirements for the tender.

# Guiding Questions

- What are **important core criteria** regarding the procurement of lamps?
  
- Information is available:
  - EU-GPP website:  
[http://ec.europa.eu/environment/gpp/pdf/criteria/indoor\\_lighting.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/environment/gpp/pdf/criteria/indoor_lighting.pdf)
  
  - International Energy efficiency Labels:  
<https://www.energystar.gov/>
  
  - Eco-Label schemes in your country:  
[http://www.globalecolabelling.net/categories\\_7\\_criteria/list\\_by\\_country/index.htm](http://www.globalecolabelling.net/categories_7_criteria/list_by_country/index.htm)

# Developing Core Criteria for Lamps

Before Criteria can be set, the subject matter is to be defined. It explains the aspect of the procurement of the product.

Fluorescent Lamps	
Subject Matter	
Purchase of resource and energy efficient lamps	
<b>Technical Specifications</b>	
Replacement lamps for existing installations shall have a <b>lamp luminous efficacy</b> equal to or greater than the minimum efficacy of the relevant energy class given below	
e.g. Energy Saving Lamp must hold Energy efficiency class A in the EU etc.	
...	
...	
<b>Verification:</b> Lamp label of the <b>specified energy class</b> or better. Products holding a Type I <b>ecolabel</b> shall be deemed to comply, provided that this ecolabel fulfils the requirements listed above. <b>Other appropriate means of proof</b> will be accepted such as manufacturer's lamp efficacy statement (lumens per Watt) and a calculation showing that it equals or exceeds the minimum value for the stated energy class.	

# Overview Group Work Activities Day 2

- 1** Group Work 1: Core Criteria and Verification Methods
- 2** Group Work 2: Comprehensive / Excellence Criteria and Verification
- 3** Group Work 3: Integration of LCC-based Criteria
- 4** Group Work 4: Award Point System for Evaluation

## Group Work 2: Comprehensive / Excellence Criteria

### Comprehensive criteria:

- are more ambitious than core criteria and take into account more aspects or higher levels of environmental performance
- are for those who wish to purchase the best products available on the market

### Examples:

- A refrigerator is 20% more efficient than stated in the core criteria
- A lamp has a 10% longer lifetime than stated in the core criteria

Comprehensive criteria are not mandatory requirements in the tender. Extra credit or points can be give for tender with products complying with comprehensive / excellence criteria.

# Guiding Questions and Information

- What are possible comprehensive **criteria** regarding the procurement of lamps? Information is available:
  - Requirements on Products with the Best Available Technology (BAT) on <http://www.topten.info>
  - Independent Tests and Consulting (e.g. EU-Project Premium Light) [www.premiumlight.eu](http://www.premiumlight.eu)
  - EU-GPP website: [http://ec.europa.eu/environment/gpp/pdf/criteria/indoor\\_lighting.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/environment/gpp/pdf/criteria/indoor_lighting.pdf)
  - International Energy efficiency Labels: <https://www.energystar.gov/>



# Developing Comprehensive Criteria

## Fluorescent Lamps

### Subject Matter

Purchase of resource and energy efficient lamps

### Technical Specifications

Lamps for new and renovated installations, and replacement lamps in existing installations, shall have a lifetime not less than that given in the table below.

- Compact Fluorescent Lamps of min. 12.000 hours

**Verification:** Products holding a Ten ecolabel shall be deemed to comply, provided that this ecolabel fulfils the requirements above. Other appropriate means of proof will be accepted such as the result of lamp testing according to the test procedure in EN 50285 or equivalent.

Comprehensive Criteria are more ambitious than core criteria; regarding lifetime here core criteria could be 10.000 hours

## Overview Group Work Activities Day 2

- 1** Group Work 1: Core Criteria and Verification Methods
- 2** Group Work 2: Excellence Criteria and Verification
- 3** Group Work 3: Integration of LCC-based Criteria
- 4** Group Work 4: Award Point System for Evaluation

## Group Work 3: Integration of LCC criteria

Life Cycle Costing (LCC) takes into account all costs that occur during the full life-cycle of a product.

Compact Fluorescent Lamp (CFL)			
	Quantity	Unit Price	Total Costs
<b>Procurement</b>	10000	30.000 IDR	10000*30.000 IDR
Delivery			
Installation			
<b>Usage (Energy Costs)</b>	<b>Energy Consumption per year * average life time in years* number of lamps</b>	400 IDR per kWh	...
Maintenance			
Disposal			
<b>TOTAL LIFE CYCLE COSTS</b>			

## Group Work 3: Integration of LCC criteria

- Assumptions for the calculation of costs during usage:
  - The energy consumption of the fluorescent lamp per year would be **10 kWh** ( $10\text{W} * 2,74 \text{ hours per day} * 365 \text{ days} / 1000$ )
  - Please assume that the lamp's lifetime is **12 years**
  - Please assume that the **number of purchased lamps is 10000**
  - Please assume that **one unit of energy (Kilowatthours costs 400 IDR)**
  - **For simplification please neglect delivery, installation, maintenance and disposal**
- Please calculate the total life cycle costs of the lamps.
- Please **re-do** the example with **lamps that consume less energy, e.g. 8 kWh**. What would be the total life cycle costs?

## Overview Group Work Activities Day 2

- 1** Group Work 1: Core Criteria and Verification Methods
- 2** Group Work 2: Excellence Criteria and Verification
- 3** Group Work 3: Integration of LCC-based Criteria
- 4** Group Work 4: Award Point System for Evaluation

# Award Point System for Evaluation

Guiding Question: Which tender should be selected?

No.	Criterion	Weight (%)	Max. Score	Min. Score required	Points for Tender 1	Points for Tender 2
(A)	<i>Recycling</i>	20%	200	0		
(B)	<i>Technical Support</i>	10%	100	50		
(C)	<i>LCC</i>	50%	500	250		
(D)	<i>Packaging</i>	20 %	200	100		
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>Sum: 100 %</b>	1000	400		

Finally, the tender with the highest score is selected.

# Explanation of Award Criteria

## (A) Recycling

- **Example: Does the supplier offer a take back system?**
- If yes, 200 points are awarded.

## (B) Technical Support

- **Example: Does the supplier offer technical support?**
- If yes, one hour of technical support per year is translated into 1 point.

## (C) Life Cycle Costs

- The tender with the lowest Life-Cycle Cost is awarded with all the points  
e.g. LCC of Tender 1 is **100,000 € → 500 points**
- Less points are awarded to the other tenders, e.g. LCC of Tender 2 is **200,000 € only 250 points** are awarded.

# Explanation of Award Criteria

## (D) Packaging

- **Example: Packaging of the products shall be provided by carton made of xy % of recycled pulp.**
- 1 % of recycled pulp in the packaging material is transposed in 2 points, so 50% of recycled pulp translates into 100 points.

Please define and explain a possible award point system for the selection of tenders for fluorescent lamps.



# Contact

---

**Siddharth Prakash**  
Senior Researcher

**Oeko-Institut e.V.**

Phone: +49 (0) 761 45295 244  
E-Mail: [s.prakash@oeko.de](mailto:s.prakash@oeko.de)

**Tobias Schleicher**  
Researcher

**Oeko-Institut e.V.**

Phone: +49 (0) 761 45295 277  
E-Mail: [t.schleicher@oeko.de](mailto:t.schleicher@oeko.de)